Tri-State Masonry Institute held its 13th Annual Architectural Awards Celebration to recognize designers and the masonry industry at the Clovernook Country Club. The “People’s Choice Award” was once again honored. Voting for the People’s Choice Award took place at the banquet during the reception where attendees we able to view the projects. All of the architects representing the winning projects were guests of TMI at this annual event and where recognised with the TMI contractors for each project. In this publication are the projects honored with comments from the jury prepared by Tony Costello, Costello + Associates, FAIA.

Excellence in Masonry Design Award
Cincinnati Public Schools Woodford Paideia

Architect: GBBN Architects
Mason Contractor: Jess Hauer Masonry
Submitted by: Division 4, Inc.

As one juror put it … “Wouldn’t it be great if every student in grades K-6 in the country could be as fortunate as the 550 students who attend this school! We might have more students inspired to become an architect, artist or mason!”

The jury chair offered three quotes he just used in a client meeting in which he discussed the concept of “architecture as art.”

1. Architecture is an art when one consciously or unconsciously creates aesthetic emotion in the atmosphere and when this environment produces well-being. (Luis Barragan)
2. Architecture starts when you carefully put two bricks together. There it begins. (Ludwig Mies van der Rohe)
3. All architecture, which does not express serenity, fails in its spiritual mission. Thus, it has been a mistake to abandon the shelter of walls for the inclemency of large areas of glass. (Luis Barragan)

The jury felt that this was a building that conveyed to all who entered … whether student, teacher, administrator, or citizen … welcome to a building that celebrates the joy of learning … of seeing exciting possibilities of artistic expression in one of the most common of architectural elements … the wall.

The “Architect’s Statement” proved without a doubt that the architect of this building envisioned and used various colored brick the way a painter would see and apply different colors of paint. To quote:

Woodford Paideia Academy is a Cincinnati Public School that influences 550 Pre-K -6th grade learners. Situated on a topographically varied and treed neighborhood site, the new facilities design was inspired by neighborhood architectural landmarks and nearby park surroundings. The traditional massing silhouettes are enhanced with a tactile play of masonry products. Inspired by quality of tree bark, the primary brick is an Endicott Dark Ironspot Artisan 4x12 unit.
Contrasting the Ironspot and celebrating the schools primary and evening entrances, an ashlar patterned Arriscraft Cumberland Building Stone stitches into the rough brick. A Carolina Ceramic Pebble Beach brick was positioned along the 3 story classroom street facade to better display the playful classroom shadowed openings that recede inward to help southern shading. Further banding details create a sense of discovery and playfulness that is the result of scratching away the building “bark”—thus revealing both Carolina Ceramic’s Pebble Beach and Chestnut brick blends.

Banding subtleties include a harmony between regular / organic patterns and pauses between pattern or material changes—further emphasizing a purposeful and deliberate texture. The building structure primary consists of a painted CMU bearing interior, with a color palette that provides wayfinding and sensitivity to nature and the site. The entry foyer transitions the exterior stone and brick through the entry vestibule and cast stone caps top off the school’s monumental stair. Tactile exterior textures are drawn to the interior when a few transitioning corridors use a splitface block finish to contrast the predominant smooth face unit.

To say that this architect can “talk the talk” is an understatement. However, the jury’s unanimous decision to award the 2012 TMI EXCELLENCE IN MASONRY AWARD to the Woodford Paideia Elementary School is strictly because this architect can “Walk the Walk”.

This project impressed the jury in many ways and at many scales. These included: the clarity of the plan organization with clearly identified entrances for both student and after-school, public functions; seamless transition from indoor to outdoor spaces; effective use and clear articulation of simple building forms that reduce the visual mass of the complex; celebration of natural light; limited pallet of masonry and other materials; and careful detailing of these materials.

Two aspects of this building that immediately impressed the jury was the sequence of designed elements that created a visual and physical procession. These included the masonry columned and ornamental iron “gateway,” the clean, crisp cantilevered entry canopy and the visually powerful ... basilica-like... main entry hall. They envisioned this space as “main street” of the school and lauded the transparency between it and adjacent spaces, the quality of materials and natural light and the subtle reference to the vaulting of the ceilings one would have found in historic basilica spaces like this.
They also felt the designer took extra care and concern for the detailing and articulation inherent in the masonry construction and other material systems. This can be readily seen in the stone and brick detailing on both the exterior and interior as well as the crisp handling of the metal panel fascia system, metal and glass curtain wall and the large Kalwall facades of the vaulted gymnasium space.

The jury members concluded its discussion by agreeing that it was evident to each of them that this quality of architecture is achieved only through an effective working relationship where there is mutual respect each team member including the school board, building committee, architect and his/her professional consultants, general contractor, masonry supplier and masonry contractor. Not to be overlooked are the citizens of this school district who support good architecture and, in doing so, provide their children with learning environments that both inspire and support their efforts to become educated and contributing members of society.

The jury was very impressed with the total design of this medical center … obviously a very large building complex, a typology often not recognized for finely detailed architecture. This planning and design quality is evident from its site planning and landscape development to its conceptual massing that reduces the visual scale of the five story building to a more human scale to the very well-considered use of masonry materials in creating the major esthetic statement.

While totally modern in their execution, the architect skillfully uses time-tested design approaches in the use of rusticated stone at the meeting of building and ground that transitions to smooth, dressed stone with the rustication used for the lintels over the large opening. Above this, the four-story wall is clad in a pattern using two colors of brick and the large window openings to create a façade of restrained elegance. The wall terminates with a recessed, fifth story clad in a metal and glass curtain wall system that is modulated by the structural bays and topped by a distinctive projecting cornice.

Congratulations to all Winners!
The architect also chose to use stone allowing both the auto drop-off and the two-story, curved wall it leads to at the entry, giving the arrival and entry sequence a sense that this is a facility of high quality … both in the building and in the critical services offered within.

In addition to the uniqueness of a school that serves grades K-12, the jury applauded the fact that it contains dedicated spaces for the Cincinnati Eye Clinic, the Mentoring Center, and the Cincinnati Early Learning Center … an innovative preschool day care and education center.

In addition, Oyler offers a virtual school to encourage lifelong, on-line learning. Taken collectively, the jury felt these components accommodated in this school allows it to serve as a model for other schools that serve a population living in disinvested neighborhoods.

Designed by the prominent Cincinnati firm of Hannaford & Sons over 80 years ago, this building is a great example of the integration of art and architecture that were common place in school buildings from the 1880’s through the late 1940’s when the Modernist Movement began to emerge as the prevalent school of design theory and practice. This transition was accelerated by the “white flight” from inner-city neighborhoods to the suburbs where land was plentiful and schools of one and two stories became the norm.

The preservation and restoration of the brick and stone as well as that of the extensive amount of glazed terra cotta as the material for ornamentation on both the exterior and interior is very skillfully handled. Insensitive alterations over the many years of the school’s existence were reversed so as to again contribute esthetically to the building’s esthetics.

The skill of the architect is no less apparent than in the addition of the gymnasium … a large volume due to the functions contained within. The jury felt the architect achieved an addition that one could label as a “good close neighbor” to the original building. From the careful siting that created a void between the old and new and provided the space for a disabled accessible ramped, entrance to both gym and the school to the very
sophisticated interpretation of the architectural style of the original building … especially the simplification of the detailing that allowed it to be both compatible with the more intricate original, yet affordable to produce and construct.

The jury chair summed it up in the statement, “Celebrating that built by past generations while enriching the future of generations yet unborn is a noble undertaking.” This project does that so well!

**Honor Award**

**Public Service Masonry Design**

**Washington Park**

Architect: BHDP Architecture

Mason Contractor: Benchmark Masonry Contractors, Inc.

Submitted By: The Quikrete Companies

The jury understood the significance of this project in terms of its historic importance to the city of Cincinnati and, especially, to the revitalization of the Over-the-Rhine neighborhood. It felt that the design and construction team more than lived up to the challenges faced in the redesign of this park … both in its landscape architecture and the architecture. It not only lauded the resulting project but what must have been a very complex and difficult path and process to bring this project from concept to fruition. It surmised that the negotiations between multiple public, not-for-profit, and private stakeholders … especially the neighborhood residents, along with multiple funding sources and political forces probably made for more than a few newspaper articles.

Every aspect of this park … especially the sophisticated “Barcelona Pavilion-like” main structure and incorporation of historic park elements … conveys a very inclusive and well-considered programming, planning, and design process. This is reinforced in the material selection and detailing of every element of landscape architecture including informal seating areas, masonry and ornamental iron topped walls and bollards that define varied hard and soft-scaped areas, ADA compliant ramps, lighting and paving materials and patterns.

This is urban park, landscape design that carries on the spirit of the great, historic landscape architects like Olmstead and Kesseler and those of the Modernist movement including Lawrence Halprin and Paul Freidburg. It is truly something all of Cincinnati can be proud of.
Uponits viewing the first slide … w/o reading the brief, the jury … including the chair … prepared themselves to evaluate the restoration and possible addition to a historic home that … through the permanence of its rubble stone exterior that had stood the test of time for well over a century. It was pleasantly surprised and impressed … that this project represented the results of what had to have been a very successful partnership of a client, architect, masonry contractor and skilled masons.

These results, of course, are a stately residential complex that sits serenely upon a knoll in a rural context. The purity of strong forms (unbroken gabled roofs on simple rectangular forms) for the major house, attached garage, and freestanding structure that, historically in an urban setting, would have been called a “carriage house” and in a rural or agrarian context … “an outbuilding, stable, etc.

In addition to the stone, the jury complemented the choice of a limited pallet of quality materials, detailed by an experienced designer, and crafted to the highest standards. These included the standing seam metal roofing, bead-board porch ceiling, tapered wood above a stone base porch columns, and copper gutters & downspouts. The one area where the jury felt that the simple strong statements may have been compromised a bid … fully appreciating the functional requirements of dealing with a lower level … was in the rear of the house where the forms and detailing have more of a “mansion scale.”

In all … a great project certainly worthy of an Honor Award. Bravo!
Merit Award & People’s Choice
Secondary Education
Masonry Design
Talawanda High School
Architect: SHP Leading Design
Mason Contractor: Accurate Masonry. LLC
Submitted By: Division 4, Inc.

The jury appreciated the “Architect’s Statement” that informed them about the building’s design being influenced by the desire to relate to the nearby Miami of Ohio campus that has used the Georgian Style of Architecture since its inception. This knowledge reaffirms the architect’s use of arched heads above all windows, including the flattened brick arch in the large window above the entry as well as in the large windows that are placed within a cast stone composition that include segmented arches at the heads. This is also evident in the use of neo-Doric columns for the colonnade at the entry and along the entry façade.

They also lauded the manner in which the large side elevations of the gymnasium are designed so as to break down their scale through the use of the light-colored cast stone on the base and engaged pilasters as well as the strong horizontal, metal panel clad element.

The jury concluded its discussion by complementing the school district for investing in masonry materials as the major exterior expression of both sense of permanence and the tax dollar well-invested in a quality building. They actually pointed out that this is nowhere more evident than in the investment in the same quality masonry materials … here using split-face CMU’s with a cast stone sill for the wainscoting with brick above. More typically, school boards are prone … due to budget problems …. to relegate these ancillary buildings to those built of pre-engineered steel with corrugated siding or wood pole-barn construction.

Projects were submitted by the following TMI Members

DIVISION 4 INC.
Face Brick • Stone • Architectural CMU

Essroc Italcementi Group
A world class local business

Olliler Masonry Inc.

QUIKRETE
Cement & Concrete Products™

Reading Rock
Merit Award  
K-6 Education Masonry Design  
Mt. Washington  
Elementary PK-8 School  
Architect: Moody-Nolan, Inc.  
Mason Contractor: Benchmark Masonry Contractors, Inc.  
Submitted by: Reading Rock

In its review of this project, the jury lauded the fact that this small addition to a historic building was given the attention that it deserved.

In keeping with the focus of this awards program, the most substantial materials that the architects used were that of the centuries-old tradition of the use of brick with stone trim prevalent in educational facilities … from K-6 through to university buildings. In addition to the ability to respond to the esthetic expression of every historic style masonry has proven over the centuries to be a material system with the hallmarks of durability, low maintenance, and the unique ability to convey permanence.

The architect’s and masons’ skill are evident in the detailing and workmanship found in both the stone and brick work … especially in the complex cornice that combines both.

The jury did have a spirited discussion concerning the contrast with both the Modernist design and color of the canopies and downspouts as well as the scale of the lighting fixtures and their placement on the quoins at the corner of the building.

Merit Award  
Secondary Education Masonry Design  
Mariemont Junior High School  
Architect: SFA Architects, Inc.  
Mason Contractor: Weisbrod Masonry  
Submitted by: Division 4, Inc.

The jury appreciated the “Architect’s Statement” that informed them about the building’s design being informed by Georgian Style of architecture, long a hallmark of the Mariemont Local School District.

With this providing the criteria for evaluation, the jury applauded the architect for responding to this opportunity to design in a historic style favored by the client and … probably the tax payers of the district as they would support a continuity among their district’s buildings.
They noted the adherence by the architect to the Georgian principles in terms of proportion … from that of the overall massing to that of how doors and windows including the “8 over 8” lights were handled. Also of importance was the architects ability to use the materials one associates with the Georgian Style … red-brick load bearing walls laid in running bond with herring-bone coursing at special elements … detailed with limestone for heads and sills at windows, surround at the. Not to be forgotten are the traditional, columned entry portico and copper-topped.

The “Architect’s Statement” really helped the jury when they evaluated this project in that they understood from the beginning the selection of the masonry as a major exterior material fulfilled the goal of continuing with the brick synonymous with the client’s original buildings on their main campus.

The jury members were impressed with the architect’s skillful design of the buildings elevations using the traditional Italian-Renaissance, tripartite parti of base, wall with “punched openings, and projecting cornice found in the urban palazzo.

They were especially taken by the incorporation of another element found in Italian Renaissance buildings … the appearance of a “loggia” at the top floor created by the full-height columns at each bay and large glass façade of the top floor. A variation takes place on the rear elevation with the use of piloti … the columned base made famous by the architect, Le Corbusier.

Lastly, the jury lauded the incorporation of the stone-clad, vertical tower coupled with the two adjacent bays clad in a metal & glass curtain wall system. This combination creates a very strong, visual orientation from the parking lot and definition to the point of entry … something often not found in contemporary buildings.
The jury felt that this project is an example of what can result in terms of a strong piece of architecture when an architect’s design decisions are based on the age-old principals underlying Modernist design: functionalism; honesty in the expression of a limited number of materials; and clean, crisp detailing.

They also added ... well-considered graphics ... often lacking and in many cases a visual blight when the sign company becomes the designer!

This last design consideration becomes very clear as soon as one initially views and approaches the buildings. The composition of the company’s logo and script in juxtaposition with the cantilevered canopy and sculptural element of the adjacent entry that is clad in an aluminum panel system creates a strong visual, entry and iconic statement. This carries through and is reinforced by font type and size selected ... as well as its justification on the right. They would have enjoyed seeing a photo of how this reads at night as it appears the logo and large font are of a lighted nature.

The jury also appreciated the manner in which the architect broke down the mass of the other elevations ... including the two story at the rear and how this was reinforced by the design of the placement of three colors of brick. The most obvious is the use of the dark brown brick in a three-course, soldier bond cornice that is used alternatively with that of the aluminum panel system. However, upon closer study one notices that the base of the building includes a wainscoting of what appears to be CMU’s of the exact brick colors above and the single soldier course under the metal cornice element. This is masonry detailing at its best.

Tri-State Masonry Institute is the Southwest Regional partner of the Ohio Masonry Association and its contractors are members of the Mason Contractors Association of America.
The jury recognized the architect’s success in designing this elementary school whose scale allows it to fit both comfortably into its context of a residential neighborhood as well to provide a building that they believed would relate well to elementary students. They also noted that the decision to reduce the visual scale of the length of the front façade through the placement of the three projecting, cabled-end elements. They also felt the smaller imposed gabled projection with large windows echo the bay windows often found on both historic and contemporary homes. The placement of the large gymnasium element to the rear of the building completes this successful scaling of the building.

At a more detail level … that of the pallet and detailing of materials chosen … the jury complimented the use of the standing seam, metal roofing system to modulate the large roof planes. In addition, the careful detailing of the integrated system for the fascia, soffit and gutter provides a strong visual statement as it wraps the building. Lastly, the well-considered choice and detailing of red brick walls with the gray brick of the wainscoting and window surrounds provides the building with a very strong, simple statement.

The school district, as client, is to be complimented for recognizing the long-term value that masonry materials brings to this project.

Special Thanks to our Event Sponsors

Accurate Masonry LLC  Ironclay Masonry Products
Byer Steel Group  J. Construction Co., Inc.
Cemex  Jess Hauer Masonry
Division 4, Inc.  Ollier Masonry, Inc.
Essroc Cement  Miter Masonry Contractors, Inc.
Flach Brothers Masonry  The Quikrete Companies
The jury lauded several aspects of this building with respect to its design ... all of which focused on the skillful use of masonry.

First, it recognized the iconic role played by the two curved, stone-veneered walls that extend above the roof lines of the building's major spaces that are clad in red/brown brick or metal and glass curtain wall system. These walls also provide a strong visual cue to the major circulation route from the main entry accessed from the parking lot in front to a large covered patio at the rear of the building that opens to a park.

At a smaller scale, the jury lauded the creation of a number of “framed views” through these walls that are framed with a contrasting, dressed, cast stone ... creating what are “painting-like” views. They also complimented the care taken by the architect that is evident in the detail where these stone walls intersect the ceiling plane resulting in linear, recessed lighting alcoves.

Lastly ... the jury wanted to make sure that the workmanship of the masons as evident in the thin-set stone walls or clean, crisp brick masses was acknowledged as an example of their superior skill and craftsmanship that could easily label them as “true artisans of their trade.”

TMI provides quality educational programs for designers, owners, contractors, educators, public officials, school boards, etc.

For more information about TMI’s educational programs or to inquire about TMI’s promotional activities contact Josh Naragon, Executive Director at 800-443-6779 or masonry@hughes.net.
Judging Criteria

The judges evaluated submissions to determine if a project was worthy of an award and what award should be designated. To be worthy of an award, a project must:

1. EXHIBIT DESIGN EXCELLENCE as a piece of architecture at all scales - from site development to material detailing … regardless of its function, size, contexts (freestanding or dense, urban site), or cost.
2. RECOGNIZE THE CONTRIBUTION A BUILDING MAKES TO ENHANCE THE “QUALITY OF LIFE” of a community, whether it a public, not-for-profit, or private sector facility.
3. CELEBRATE THE USE OF MASONRY as used on both of the exterior and in the interior of a building, as well as its use in adding significantly to the quality of the site development: hardscape-landscape design.
4. RECOGNIZE THE FULL RANGE OF “APPROPRIATE USES” of masonry in terms of it being a primary material system used or a secondary material system that compliments another material system that logically is used as a primary material system.
5. RECOGNIZE THE EXPLORATION OF THE UNLIMITED RANGE OF ESTHETIC STATEMENTS that can be achieved through the creative use of masonry.
6. RECOGNIZE THE CONTRIBUTION MADE BY MASONS THROUGH THEIR OUTSTANDING WORKMANSHIP to enhance the quality of architecture and site development.

The criteria used by the judges in determining the award level a project receives:

A MERIT AWARD was granted to worthy submissions that met the basic submissions requirements including masonry design and installation as set forth in the TMI Awards Program.
AN HONOR AWARD was granted to a project that responded in a very positive and meritorious manner to a large number of the criteria and with respect for its building type.
AN EXCELLENCE AWARD was granted to a project that responded in an exceptional manner to almost all the criteria and with respect for its building type.
THE EXCELLENCE IN MASONRY AWARD WAS BESTOWED ON A SINGLE PROJECT in recognition of the excellent and exemplary manner in which it met all of the criteria and the opinion of the jury, rose above all others, regardless of its building type.

Jury Members

Tony Costello, FAIA, Jury Chair (Non-voting)
Irving Distinguished Professor Emeritus of Architecture, Ball State University
& Principal, COSTELLO + ASSOCIATES, Muncie, IN

Tanner Jordan, AIA,
Ass’t. Director of Campus Facilities Planning, Ball State Univ., Muncie, IN

Bryan Hollars, AIA,
Principal, Studio 3Architects, Muncie, IN

Dan Overbey, AIA
Director, Sustainable Practice, BDMD, Indianapolis, IN